Frictional strength and wear-rate of carbonate faults during high-velocity, steady-state sliding

Yuval Boneh a,1, Amir Sagy b, Ze’ev Reches a,∗

a School of Geology and Geophysics, University of Oklahoma, Norman, OK 73019, United States
b Geological Survey of Israel, 30 Melkhe Israel St., Jerusalem, Israel

A R T I C L E   I N F O
Article history:
Received 16 January 2013
Received in revised form 29 August 2013
Accepted 31 August 2013
Available online xxxx
Editor: P. Shearer

Keywords:
faulting
wear
friction
experimental
high slip velocity

A B S T R A C T
We ran an extensive series of shear experiments to test the effect of shear velocity and normal stress on wear-rate and frictional strength. The experiments were conducted on three types of carbonate samples with a rotary shear apparatus on solid, ring-shaped rock samples that slipped for displacements up to tens of meters at slip velocity of \( V = 0.002–0.96 \text{ m/s} \), and normal stress \( \sigma_n = 0.25–6.9 \text{ MPa} \).

The analysis reveals that during steady-state stage, the values of wear-rate and frictional strength depend on both slip velocity and normal stress. The wear-rates at low slip velocity show linear relations to the normal stress (Archard’s model), however, at high velocity, \( V > 0.5 \text{ m/s} \), the wear-rates are independent of the normal stress, and may vanish at the highest velocity and normal stress of the present experiments. The steady-state friction coefficient, \( \mu \), correlates best with the experimental power-density (shear stress \( \cdot \) slip velocity). We recognized three friction regimes: high \( \mu > 0.8 \) at low power-density, low \( \mu \sim 0.3 \) at high power-density, and a transition regime of fast drop of friction coefficient as the power-density increases from 0.03 to 0.3 MW/m². Runs of low power-density (high friction) displayed fault surfaces covered with fine-grained gouge, whereas runs of high power-density (low friction) displayed shiny, smooth fault surfaces. We interpret the observed intensity variations of wear-rate and frictional strength as indicating a brittle to ductile transition associated with frictional heating.

© 2013 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Slipping along faults is associated with friction and wear that depend on multiple, interdependent factors (Fig. 1) such as the intensity of applied loads, fault-zone composition and structure, environmental conditions (fluids chemistry/pressure, humidity and temperature), and slip surface characteristics (e.g., roughness, pore pressure, gouge thickness and grain size). The friction coefficient (Byerlee, 1978), and the wear coefficient (Archard, 1953) are respectively the common parameters for fault strength and wear accumulation rate. Our present objective is to experimentally characterize the connection between frictional strength and wear-rate in carbonate faults, and to test the effects of shear velocity and normal stress on both constitutions.

Wear accumulation volume, \( G \), during shear between two surfaces is assumed (Archard, 1953) to follow the relations of

\[ G = K \cdot D \cdot \left( \frac{\sigma_n}{H} \right) \]  

where \( K \) (wear coefficient) is related to the material properties and shear conditions, \( D \) is the slip distance, \( \sigma_n \) is the normal stress, and \( H \) is the hardness of the softer component of the slipping system. This formula is based on the assumption that wear occurs at the real contact area between the sliding surfaces which is restricted to the touching asperities. Queener et al. (1965)
recognized that wear exhibits two distinct stages. An initial, transient stage, which is regarded as ‘running-in’ of the slip surfaces, exhibits very intense wear-rate due to interaction and failure of the prominent asperities. This stage evolves into steady-state with a modest to low, constant wear-rate. Later tribological analyses indicated that wear of metals depends on the combined effect of normal stress and slip velocity (Soda et al., 1975; Lim et al., 1987; Stupak et al., 1990; Kong and Ashby, 1992; Kishore et al., 2000), and not solely on the normal stress.

The above concepts were adopted to experimental studies of faulting and rock wear in which intact rock blocks slipped against each other (Yoshioka, 1986; Biegel et al., 1992; Bointott et al., 1992; Wang and Scholz, 1994). Experiments were conducted at low slip velocity (150 μm/s) and displacements up to 2 m, and showed good agreement with Archard’s model. Scholz (1987) discussed the general correlation between the thickness of gouge zones and the total slip distance of the host faults (also Wilson et al., 2005). Power et al. (1988) assumed that the roughness of natural faults is fractal and therefore their wear is always transient. Nevertheless, they also suggested a linear relationship between slip distance and wear volume because larger asperities are statistically more common as slip increases (Power et al., 1988). Recently, Hirose et al. (2012) revealed more complicated relations in experiments of higher velocity (up to 0.27 m/s) and longer displacements (up to 220 m). They found that the wear rates of granite and diorite samples displayed power and exponential relations to the normal stress, and not the linear relations predicted by Archard (1953).

We investigate here the effects of two controlling factors, slip velocity and normal stress, on the wear and friction of carbonate faults. The analysis is based on experimental measurements on cylindrical samples (Fig. 2A) sheared in a rotary shear apparatus at a wide range of normal stresses and slip velocities (Fig. 2B). A central component of the experiments is the continuous monitoring of fault-normal-displacement, the records of which were used to determine the continuous wear-rate. In addition, we measured shear stress, temperature and slip distance, and used these measurements to discuss the apparent correlation between steady-state wear-rate reduction, slip weakening and temperature increase. The experimental observations are used to examine the validity of wear models and to estimate fault frictional strength at in-situ conditions.

2. Experimental settings

We used a rotary shear apparatus capable of applying normal stresses up to 35 MPa, slip velocities of 0.001 to 2 m/s, and unlimited slip distance (Appendix A, Fig. 11). Continuous monitoring up to 10 kHz recording rate included measurement of normal load, shear load, slip velocity, fault normal displacement, and sample temperature. Details of the experimental systems are outlined in Appendix A.

The experimental faults are made of two cylindrical blocks, the lower one has a flat surface and the upper one has a raised ring structure with dimensions of either 5.40 cm and 7.60 cm as inner and outer diameters, respectively, or 6.32 cm and 8.32 cm as inner and outer diameters, respectively (Figs. 11, 12). We used the mean radius for velocity calculations. Three types of experimental faults were used: (1) a fault made of two Kasota dolomite (KD) blocks; (2) a fault made of two Dover limestone (DL) blocks; and (3) a fault made of one Kasota dolomite upper block and a harder Blue quartzite (KDBQ) lower block. This setup provides a bi-material fault with compositional and hardness contrast. Sample blocks were ground flat, roughened with #600 SiC grit and dried for 24 hr at 100°C. The experiments were performed at room temperature (~20°C) and room humidity. The sample temperature during the experiment was measured with one or two thermocouples embedded within the rock at a distance of 3 mm from the sliding surface. Most runs were conducted without opening the two blocks between experiments, whereas in some runs, the experimental fault was opened for gouge collection and inspection. We performed 87 experiments with slip distances of 2 m to 28 m at slip velocity of 0.002 m/s to 0.96 m/s, and normal stresses between 0.25 MPa to 6.9 MPa (Fig. 2B). These experiments include 72 constant-velocity run (DL – 23, KD – 28, KDBQ – 21) and 15 velocity-stepping runs (with 2–6 velocity steps) with Kasota dolomite.

Three methods have been used to calculate wear: (1) Weight of wear products collected from the sliding surfaces (Wang and Scholz, 1994); (2) Wear volume determined from fault-normal-displacement (Reches and Lockner, 2010); and (3) Optical measurements of the worn surfaces. We used the second method since it is the only one that allows continuous measurement of wear without disruption of the experiment or modification of the fault surfaces.

Wear-rate calculations are based on the measurement of the Fault Normal Displacement (FND), which is the displacement normal to the fault surface measured by two or four eddy-current sensors (Figs. 2A, 12). These non-contact sensors detect displacement by magnetic field changes with an accuracy of ~1 μm. The sensors measure the distance change between the upper and lower blocks. Details of the wear-rate calculations appear in Appendix A.
3. Experimental observations

3.1. Evolution of wear, wear-rate and strength

In our experiments, the wear-rate and the frictional strength evolved with time and slip distance, similarly to previous observations (Queener et al., 1965; Power et al., 1988; Wang and Scholz, 1994). The early stage of the slip displayed high values of wear-rates and friction coefficients (Fig. 3) that correspond to the transient, running-in stage. Significantly lower values of both wear-rate and friction coefficient evolved into the steady-state stage (Figs. 3A–C). Boneh et al. (submitted for publication) found that the wear-rate (black curves) and the friction coefficient (red curves) evolve in similar style and over similar distances (1–3 m) during the running-in stage (Figs. 3). They discuss this transition in details, and here we focus on the wear-rates at steady-state.

3.2. Steady-state wear-rate

One of our most significant observations is demonstrated in Fig. 4 that displays the steady-state wear-rates for four sets of experiments in Dover limestone (DL) (Fig. 4A) and four sets in Kasota dolomite–Blue quartzite sample (KDBQ) (Fig. 4B). Each experiment was run at a constant velocity that ranged from 0.006 to 0.3 m/s, and at different normal stresses. In Figs. 4A and 4B, the wear-rates of low velocity runs are marked by a blue, dashed ellipse, and the high velocity runs are marked by a red, dashed ellipse. Two features are apparent in these graphs. First, at slip velocity \( <0.1 \) m/s the wear-rates increase quasi-linearly with the experimental normal stresses (green and blue dashed lines in Fig. 4), in agreement with Archard’s model. Second, the wear-rates are lower at higher slip velocities, and this is particularly clear at the highest normal stresses in both samples. These observations suggest that steady-state wear-rates depend on both slip velocity and normal stress. Fig. 4A further demonstrates that the wear-rates practically vanish at the highest normal stresses for Dover limestone.

Thus, the observations indicate that in carbonate rocks the steady-state wear-rates (1) depend on both slip velocity and normal stress, and (2) approach zero at high stresses and high slip velocities. These results deviate from Archard’s model that predicts linear increase of wear-rates with increasing normal stress. This model was based on wear of real area contacting asperities, and thus, our observations suggest a different wear mechanism as discussed later.

3.3. Steady-state friction coefficient

The results of the experiments also indicate that the measured friction coefficients of the carbonate samples depend on both slip velocity and normal stress. The experimental friction coefficients, \( \mu \), are displayed in Fig. 5A as a function of normal stress, and are divided into three velocity groups \( (V < 0.1 \text{ m/s}, V = 0.1–0.3 \text{ m/s}, \text{ and } V > 0.3 \text{ m/s}) \). For these three velocity groups, the friction coefficients decrease with increasing normal stress. The same friction data are plotted in Fig. 5B as a function of the power-density, \( PD = \tau \cdot V \) where \( \tau \) is the shear stress and \( V \) is the slip velocity; in our experiments, the PD range was 0.002–1.0 MW/m². PD is an effective parameter to characterize the mechanical loading during high-velocity shear experiments (Di Toro et al., 2011; Brown and Fialko, 2012; Chang et al., 2012).

Fig. 5B displays the steady-state friction coefficients of our three carbonate rocks with the coefficients of marble samples (Han et al., 2007). The plot shows similar distribution of the DL and KDBQ data, and somewhat different distribution for the KD results. The marble data fit the general trend of our samples, but reached lower
normal stresses under low slip velocity experiments (encircled by blue, dotted line), whereas the wear-rates drop drastically (almost vanishing) under high slip velocities (B). The wear-rates data were grouped according to the slip velocity, and each velocity group with at least three data points was plotted. Note: The wear-rates increase with as colored curves in Fig. 5A, and as expected show good fit to the normal stresses up to 100 MPa. The calculated values are plotted coefficients for four values of slip velocity (0.03, 0.1, 0.3 and 1 m/s) at normal stresses up to 100 MPa. The calculated values are plotted as colored curves in Fig. 5A, and as expected show good fit to the observed friction coefficients (colored dots). These results indicate that the friction coefficient is related to the combination of slip velocity and normal stress. This relation (Eq. (3), Fig. 5A) reflects the fault lithology (carbonates) and the experimental conditions (unconfined rock sample at room temperature and humidity). Fig. 5A indicates that at similar slip conditions, the frictional strength of a carbonate fault is low, \( \mu = 0.28 - 0.35 \), even at low velocity of \( V = 0.03 \) m/s, if the normal stress is relatively high, for example at \( \sigma_n > 50 \) MPa.

3.4. Steady-state failure envelopes

The failure envelopes of the three rock types (Figs. 6A–C) suggest increasing of ductility in the carbonate faults slipping at high velocity. In these plots, the failure envelopes are grouped according to the experimental velocity, and the envelopes were calculated as best-fit power of the form \( \tau = a \cdot \sigma_n^b \) (curve parameters in figure caption). The b values vary systematically with slip velocity: \( b \sim 1 \) (linear Coulomb envelope) at low velocity and \( b \sim 0.65 \) at the highest experimental velocity (Fig. 6D). In non-linear failure envelopes with \( b < 1 \), decreasing of the friction coefficient is reflected by the decreasing of the local slope with increasing normal stress. This decreasing of frictional resistance is a distinct property of carbonate ductility that can arise either by raising temperature (Heard, 1960) or by raising confining pressure (Handin and Hager, 1957; Handin et al., 1967; Byerlee, 1968). In the present experiments, the b values and the corresponding frictional strength decrease with increasing slip velocity (Fig. 6D), and because the normal stresses in the present experiments are constants and significantly lower than those of Heard (1960) and Handin et al. (1967), we deduce that the ductility increases is due to frictional heating at the higher velocities. Thus, we conclude, and further discuss later, that the slip along carbonate faults at high velocity activates fault-zone ductility.

3.5. Fault surface characterizations

Experimental carbonate faults that were sheared at high power-density (PD) displayed partial to almost complete coverage by
polished, shinning surfaces (Figs. 7C, D). These high PD runs also showed low wear-rates and low friction coefficients that were discussed above (Figs. 4, 5). We examined these shinning surfaces under ×50 magnification (binocular), and discuss here the main observations. Detailed multi-scale geometrical analysis of similar samples with down to 10 nm resolution was presented by Chen et al. (2013).

Experimental faults that were sheared at low PD (<0.03 MW/m²) typically displayed surfaces covered with a thin gouge layer that was formed during shear (Fig. 7A). In an unconfined experiment, the excessive gouge material was ejected out of the slipping ring and accumulated in heaps inside and outside the ring (Figs. 7A, 12). At intermediate power-density, small islands of cohesive shiny surfaces surrounded by gouge powder started to appear (Fig. 7B); the number and cumulative area of these patches increases with increasing PD (Figs. 7B, C). The shiny, polished slip surfaces are darker and glassier in appearance than the original sample surface (Fig. 7C), and their light reflectance indicates high smoothness with mean roughness <1 μm. The shiny surfaces also acquire anisotropic roughness: they are highly smooth parallel to slip direction, and wavy normal to it as measured with Atomic-Force-Microscope (Chen et al., 2013). This anisotropy corresponds to the roughness anisotropy observed along natural faults (Sagy and Brodsky, 2009; Resor and Meer, 2009). The small patches of shiny surfaces that appear at intermediate velocity, \( V = 0.05 \text{ m/s} \) (Fig. 7B) most likely developed at areas with locally elevated shear stresses at asperities that led to a local increase of frictional heating (Brown and Fialko, 2012). At higher velocity, \( V = 0.36 \text{ m/s} \), with higher frictional heating, most of the fault surface becomes shiny (Fig. 7C, D). Similar observations of local temperature increase at relatively low slip velocities were documented by Brown and Fialko (2012).

4. Discussion

4.1. Maps of carbonate wear-rates and friction coefficients

Our above observations (Figs. 4–7) demonstrate the dependence of wear-rate and friction coefficient on slip velocity and normal stress. This dependency can also be presented by wear and friction maps (Fig. 8), that are commonly used for characterization of wear resistance of industrials materials in the field of normal stress and slip velocity (Vingsbo and Soderberg, 1988; Hutchings, 1992; Lim, 2002). These maps synthesize experimental data to evaluate wear intensity and wear mechanisms for a given material composition (Wang et al., 1995; Lim, 1998).

We present here a wear-map and a friction-map (Fig. 8) for displaying the combined effect of velocity and stress on carbonate faults. Results of runs with short slip distance (\( D < 2 \) m) were excluded from the wear-map as they may include the running-in regime.

The wear-map (Fig. 8A) shows two regimes of wear intensity separated by a dotted contour line: mild wear-rate in the low normal stress regime and high velocity regime, and intense wear-rate in the regime of high normal stress and low velocity. The friction-map (Fig. 8B) shows a systematic decrease in friction coefficient at higher velocities and higher normal stresses. The friction coefficient values are separated by contours of equal PD with values of 0.1 and 0.3 MW/m². These wear and friction maps (Fig. 8) are useful tools for characterizing wear-rate and friction at a wide range of conditions, including extrapolation to natural conditions by additional experiments in the relevant velocity and normal stress.

In the present case of carbonate rocks, the maps coordinates are slip velocity and normal stress, but one can use other relevant coordinates such as temperature, fault roughness or composition. Furthermore, as wear-rate depends on many parameters (Fig. 1), the complete wear-rate map (and friction map) should be of \( n \) dimensions. While the construction of such \( n \)-dimensional space
At this three-body mode, the asperities are no longer in direct contact and are separated by a liquid or a solid lubricant (Fig. 9B) (Rabinowicz et al., 1961; Godet, 1984; Ludema, 1996). Boneh et al. (submitted for publication) found that the shear along experimental faults evolved from two-body mode to three-body mode when the fault crust which covered part or most of the sliding area. These patches are made of densely packed grains, 10–50 nm in size (Fig. 8E), that form a cohesive, highly smooth surface (Green et al., submitted for publication; Chen et al., 2013), which were most likely formed as bands of ductile flow of heated, ultra-fine gouge grains. Ductile flow of carbonate rocks strongly depends on temperature and stresses (Heard, 1960; Handin and Hager, 1957). The applied normal stress in the present experiments is relatively low; therefore, the ductility increase is primarily controlled by the frictional heating, which is now evaluated. In the experiments, the transition from two-body configuration to three-body configuration (Fig. 9) at high-velocity/high normal stress experiments is clearly associated with wear-rates drop to vanishing values (Figs. 3, 8A). As already discussed, this wear-rates drop, which contradicts Archard (1953) model, indicates a reduction asperity contact and asperity failure while the fault shear is accommodated, partly or fully, by flow within the gouge, and Archard’s “wear coefficient” (Eq. (1)) depends on slip velocity and may be on normal stress. Wear and friction reduction in three-body configuration can be explained by a few mechanisms, such as powder lubrication or flash heating. However, the observed variations in wear-rate and friction resistance in the present carbonate faults are better understood by ductility increasing of fault zone. First, the failure envelopes of our experiments are non-linear (Figs. 6A–C), and the non-linearity increases with increasing slip velocity (Fig. 6D). As mentioned above, this non-linearity indicates ductility associated with increasing temperature (Barber et al., 1994). Second, the surfaces of experimental faults that slipped at high velocity (and consequentially elevated temperature) displayed patches of shiny crust which covered part or most of the sliding area. These patches may be difficult, limiting the dependence to one variable, e.g., normal stress in Archard’s model, is clearly insufficient.

4.2. A geo-tribological view of steady-state wear

Fault sliding may occur in two tribological styles: a ‘two-body’ mode in which bare rock blocks are in direct contact along their asperities (Fig. 9A), or a ‘three-body’ mode in which the two blocks are separated by a liquid or a solid lubricant (Fig. 9B) (Rabinowicz et al., 1961; Godet, 1984; Ludema, 1996). Boneh et al. (submitted for publication) found that the shear along experimental faults evolved from two-body mode to three-body mode when the fault surfaces were gradually covered with gouge powder as slip distance increased (running-in stage). After slip distance of 0.5–3.0 m, the rock blocks were separated by a 50–200 μm thick gouge layer (Fig. 7A) (Reches and Lockner, 2010). Once the fault zone is at this three-body mode, the asperities are no longer in direct contact (Fig. 9B), the shear is accommodated within the gouge layer, and the asperity-related wear drastically reduces or even diminishes. We envision that a different mechanism dominates the wear at this configuration. A clue to this mechanism may be deduced from Fig. 9C that displays wear-rates as function of the friction coefficients for experiments run at high normal stress of $\sigma_n > 2$ MPa. The data points are scattered, yet the trends for the three fault types are similar and indicate that the wear-rates are proportional to the measured friction coefficients for the experimental faults. These observations led us (Lyakhovsky et al., submitted for publication) to develop a model for steady-state wear. The model assumes that at three-body configuration the wear occurs at the rock-gouge contact, and that the solid host rock wears by microfracturing induced damage. Lyakhovsky et al. showed that this damage is controlled by the shear stresses at the rock-gouge contact, and suggested that once the microfractures reach a critical density, the solid rock disintegrates and its fragments merge the gouge zone. The model predictions successfully fit the results of the present experiments.

The shear properties of the gouge third-body may be analyzed in terms of global flow that depends on its composition and shear conditions (Fig. 1). A brittle third-body that is composed of large and fine particles (e.g., fault gouge of quartz-bearing rocks) is sheared by granular or powder flow (Sammis and Ben-Zion, 2008; Reches and Lockner, 2010). On the other hand, the gouge may flow as a ductile third-body according to its rheology at the given temperature and grain size (Hutchings, 1992; Descartes and Berthier, 2002). For example, Smith et al. (2013) recently sheared calcite powder at high power-density, and they showed that the shear is localized within a thin layer (tens of μm) of plastically deformed, recrystallized calcite grains. These transitions into more ductile regime strongly depend on the response of fault composition to the loading and shear conditions as anticipated in our opening statement.

4.3. Fault weakening by increasing ductility

The transition from two-body configuration to three-body configuration (Fig. 9) at high-velocity/high normal stress experiments is clearly associated with wear-rates drop to vanishing values (Figs. 3, 8A). As already discussed, this wear-rates drop, which contradicts Archard (1953) model, indicates a reduction asperity contact and asperity failure while the fault shear is accommodated, partly or fully, by flow within the gouge, and Archard’s “wear coefficient” (Eq. (1)) depends on slip velocity and may be on normal stress. Wear and friction reduction in three-body configuration can be explained by a few mechanisms, such as powder lubrication or flash heating. However, the observed variations in wear-rate and friction resistance in the present carbonate faults are better understood by ductility increasing of fault zone. First, the failure envelopes of our experiments are non-linear (Figs. 6A–C), and the non-linearity increases with increasing slip velocity (Fig. 6D). As mentioned above, this non-linearity indicates ductility associated with increasing temperature (Barber et al., 1994). Second, the surfaces of experimental faults that slipped at high velocity (and consequentially elevated temperature) displayed patches of shiny crust which covered part or most of the sliding area. These patches may be difficult, limiting the dependence to one variable, e.g., normal stress in Archard’s model, is clearly insufficient.

4.3. Fault weakening by increasing ductility

The transition from two-body configuration to three-body configuration (Fig. 9) at high-velocity/high normal stress experiments is clearly associated with wear-rates drop to vanishing values (Figs. 3, 8A). As already discussed, this wear-rates drop, which contradicts Archard (1953) model, indicates a reduction asperity contact and asperity failure while the fault shear is accommodated, partly or fully, by flow within the gouge, and Archard’s “wear coefficient” (Eq. (1)) depends on slip velocity and may be on normal stress. Wear and friction reduction in three-body configuration can be explained by a few mechanisms, such as powder lubrication or flash heating. However, the observed variations in wear-rate and friction resistance in the present carbonate faults are better understood by ductility increasing of fault zone. First, the failure envelopes of our experiments are non-linear (Figs. 6A–C), and the non-linearity increases with increasing slip velocity (Fig. 6D). As mentioned above, this non-linearity indicates ductility associated with increasing temperature (Barber et al., 1994). Second, the surfaces of experimental faults that slipped at high velocity (and consequentially elevated temperature) displayed patches of shiny crust which covered part or most of the sliding area. These patches may be difficult, limiting the dependence to one variable, e.g., normal stress in Archard’s model, is clearly insufficient.

4.4. A geo-tribological view of steady-state wear

Fault sliding may occur in two tribological styles: a ‘two-body’ mode in which bare rock blocks are in direct contact along their asperities (Fig. 9A), or a ‘three-body’ mode in which the two blocks are separated by a liquid or a solid lubricant (Fig. 9B) (Rabinowicz et al., 1961; Godet, 1984; Ludema, 1996). Boneh et al. (submitted for publication) found that the shear along experimental faults evolved from two-body mode to three-body mode when the fault surfaces were gradually covered with gouge powder as slip distance increased (running-in stage). After slip distance of 0.5–3.0 m, the rock blocks were separated by a 50–200 μm thick gouge layer (Fig. 7A) (Reches and Lockner, 2010). Once the fault zone is at this three-body mode, the asperities are no longer in direct contact (Fig. 9B), the shear is accommodated within the gouge layer, and the asperity-related wear drastically reduces or even diminishes. We envision that a different mechanism dominates the wear at this configuration. A clue to this mechanism may be deduced from Fig. 9C that displays wear-rates as function of the friction coefficients for experiments run at high normal stress of $\sigma_n > 2$ MPa. The data points are scattered, yet the trends for the three fault types are similar and indicate that the wear-rates are proportional to the measured friction coefficients for the experimental faults. These observations led us (Lyakhovsky et al., submitted for publication) to develop a model for steady-state wear. The model assumes that at three-body configuration the wear occurs at the rock-gouge contact, and that the solid host rock wears by microfracturing induced damage. Lyakhovsky et al. showed that this damage is controlled by the shear stresses at the rock-gouge contact, and suggested that once the microfractures reach a critical density, the solid rock disintegrates and its fragments merge the gouge zone. The model predictions successfully fit the results of the present experiments.

The shear properties of the gouge third-body may be analyzed in terms of global flow that depends on its composition and shear conditions (Fig. 1). A brittle third-body that is composed of large and fine particles (e.g., fault gouge of quartz-bearing rocks) is sheared by granular or powder flow (Sammis and Ben-Zion, 2008; Reches and Lockner, 2010). On the other hand, the gouge may flow as a ductile third-body according to its rheology at the given temperature and grain size (Hutchings, 1992; Descartes and Berthier, 2002). For example, Smith et al. (2013) recently sheared calcite powder at high power-density, and they showed that the shear is localized within a thin layer (tens of μm) of plastically deformed, recrystallized calcite grains. These transitions into more ductile regime strongly depend on the response of fault composition to the loading and shear conditions as anticipated in our opening statement.
applied mechanical power, PD, is dissipated by frictional heating of the fault surfaces, sample cooling to the surrounding air, gouge formation, and heat diffusion into the rock sample. At steady-state shear of a given experiment, these variables maintain a quasi-constant values, as shown by constant experimental PD, and constant slopes of thermocouple temperature and wear-rate in Dover limestone experiment 2284 (Fig. 10A). Thus, if air cooling also occurs at a constant rate during the steady-state slip, the heating rate of at the thermocouple, \( T' \), is a plausible proxy of the rate of frictional heating on the fault surface. We use

\[
T' = \frac{\Delta T}{\Delta X}
\]

where \( \Delta T \) and \( \Delta X \) are the thermocouple temperature rise and the measured slip distance during the entire steady-state stage, respectively; \( T' \) units are \(^\circ C/m\). We examine below the relations between this rate and the friction coefficients.

\[
T' = 76.7 \cdot PD^{0.47} \quad (r^2 = 0.73)
\]

(red, dashed curve in Fig. 9). We already found that the friction coefficients are related to the power-density by Eq. (3) (Fig. 5B),

\[
\mu = 0.28 + 0.61 \cdot 0.012^{PD}
\]

(blue, dashed curve in Fig. 10B). The clear inverse dependence of \( \mu \) and \( T' \) on PD reveals a linear relation between friction coefficients and rate of temperature rise,

\[
\mu = 0.84 - 0.0069 \cdot T'.
\]

The dependency of the frictional strength on the temperature rise most likely indicates an acceleration of transition from brittle regime to ductile regime associated with heating rate of the
fault surface. This transition is clearly recognized in the plot of friction coefficient as function of power-density (Fig. 5B), and in the friction-map plot (Fig. 8B). Friction coefficients of $\mu > 0.8$ of the brittle regime of PD < 0.03, and friction coefficients of $\mu < 0.4$ of the ductile regime at PD > 0.3, and a brittle–ductile transition zone at PD = 0.03–0.3. The friction map (Fig. 8B) displays the friction coefficients as function of both $\sigma_n$ and $V$; thus, PD cannot be directly plotted here. Instead, we plotted two lines of constant $\sigma_n \cdot V$, which is a proxy of power-density as $PD = \mu \cdot \sigma_n \cdot V$. In the friction map, the high friction of the brittle regime is bound by $\sigma_n \cdot V < 0.1$, whereas the low friction of the ductile regime is bound by $\sigma_n \cdot V > 0.3$. Further, the brittle–ductile transition is partly recognizable in the wear-map (Fig. 8A) in which intense wear-rates at low velocity and high normal stresses are associated with brittle deformation (blue background), mild wear-rates are associated with the ductile and transitional regimes (pink background).

Finally, it is important to note that the rheology which controls friction and wear is strongly depending on fault lithology. Our experiments were conducted on carbonate rocks (limestone, dolomite and dolomite–quartzite) under a moderate range of normal stresses ($\sigma_n < 7$ MPa) and wide range of velocities (up to 1 m/s). We found that both friction coefficient and steady-state wear-rates decrease at high velocities and high normal stresses (Figs. 4–7). Interestingly, Hirose et al. (2012) reached an opposite conclusion when measured the steady-state wear-rates of quartz-bearing faults (diorite, granite and sandstone) at normal stresses of 0.21 to 6.3 MPa, and slip velocity of 0.004 to 0.27 m/s. The cause for the apparent contradiction between the two studies is the different lithological composition of the faults. Reches and Lockner (2010) tested granite samples under a similar range as Hirose et al. (2012) and found that both friction coefficient and wear-rate drastically increased at slip velocities above $\sim 0.05$ m/s (Liao and Reches, 2012). Reches and Lockner (2010) demonstrated a direct link between frictional heating and the observed fault strengthening (their Fig. 3) that was interpreted as caused by dehydration of the brittle particles in the gouge (Sammis et al., 2011). We envision that at modestly elevated temperature (500–800 °C), quartz-bearing faults stay brittle and fail by thermal fracturing, whereas carbonate faults (and their gouge) at the same temperature range become more ductile and flow without fracturing. This apparent contradiction could be eliminated by having separate wear-rate map and friction map for different lithologies, as suggested above.

5. Conclusions

The present experiments were conducted on carbonate faults under a fairly wide range of slip velocities and normal stresses. We think that the conclusions below may also be applicable to other rock types, yet such application need to be demonstrated.

1. The steady-state wear-rates of faults depend on both normal loading and slip velocity, as presented on the wear-map (Fig. 8A), indicating a deviation from Archard’s wear model. The wear-rates may practically vanish in a carbonate fault slipping at slip velocities comparable to earthquake slip-rates and at normal stresses of $\sim 2$–6 MPa.

2. The steady-state friction coefficients are best presented with respect to the mechanical power-density, $PD = \tau \cdot V = \sigma_n \cdot \mu \cdot V$ where $\tau$, $\sigma_n$, $\mu$ and $V$ are the shear stress, normal stress, friction coefficient, and slip velocity, respectively (Fig. 5).

3. Steady-state slip occurs at three-body mode under which a gouge layer separates the fault blocks, and the dominant fault wear is shifted to the gouge-rock contact.

4. In carbonate faults, the conversion of mechanical shear power into frictional heat causes a transition from brittle to ductile behavior of the gouge layer and the fault blocks.

Acknowledgements

Thanks to Andrew Madden, Shalev Siman-Tov and Xiaofeng Chen for the help and useful discussions. Harry Green kindly provided Fig. 7E. The thorough reviews and comments of Andrea Niemeijer and an anonymous reviewer significantly improved the manuscript. Support funds were provided by NSF Geosciences, Equipment and Facilities award 0732715, and NSF Geosciences, Geophysics award 1045414 to Z.R., and Israel Science Fund grant 929/10 to A.S.

Appendix A

A.1. Rotary shear apparatus (ROGA)

The present experiments were conducted on a rotary shear apparatus, referred to as ROGA. This experimental system is stationed in the School of Geology and Geophysics, Oklahoma University (Reches and Lockner, 2010). The system is designed to apply normal stresses up to 35 MPa, slip velocity in the range of 0.0003–2 m/s, and unlimited slip distance. The experimental fault behavior is recorded continuously including normal load, shear load, slip velocity, displacement normal to the fault surface, and sample temperature.
Fig. 11. The rotary shear apparatus. A. Cross section displaying power train. B. 3D view of the assembled apparatus. C. The apparatus with builder Joel Young. D. Sample blocks assembled in the loading frame. LB – lower block; UB – upper block; SR – sliding ring; TC – thermocouple wires; IR – infra-red sensor. E. Sample design shown as vertical cut-through of two cylindrical blocks of solid granite rock. The colors indicate temperature distribution due to frictional heating calculated using a finite-element model.

Fig. 12. A and B. Upper and lower block samples, marked UB and LB respectfully, after exposing the experimental (fault made of Sierra White granite). RS is the fault ring slip-surface on the upper block. EG is the ejected gouge which accumulated on the lower block at both sides of the ring slip-surface. C. A schematic cross section of the ROGA sample with the Eddy current (ED) sensors used for measuring the fault normal displacement (FND in text).

The apparatus frame is 1.8 m tall with two decks that are connected to each other by four internally enforced legs. The sample is placed between the two decks, and it is loaded by the rotary power train from below and by the normal stress from above. The power system includes:

1. A 100 HP three-phase electric motor (Baldor-Reliance), and a Baldor VS1GV AC closed vector controller that provides constant torque of up to 2600 Nm from 0 RPM to 3550 RPM. The shaft is powered by the motor with 1:6 velocity reduction sprockets.
2. A 225 kg flywheel to boost the motor torque for short rise time during high-speed tests.
3. An electro-magnetic large clutch (Ogura) that is capable of full engagement in 30 ms.
4. A hydraulic piston system (Enerpac) with axial load up to 9500 N.

ROGA has National Instruments control and monitoring system with a SCXI-1100 with modules 1124 (analog control) 1161 (relay control), 1520 (load cell/strain gage), and 1600 (data acquisition and multiplexer), as well as a USB-6210 (encoder measurements). A dedicated LabView controls the system. Digital sampling rate is up to 10 kHz. Load-cells for axial load and torque (Honeywell), gouge dilation/compaction is measured with four eddy-current sensors (Lion Precision) (1-micron accuracy), temperature measurement is with thermo-couples (Omega), and sample radial velocity encoder of 8192 sectors (Sick-Stegmann).
A.2. Wear-rate calculations

The wear calculations are based on the measurement of the Fault Normal Displacement (FND). The FND is the displacement normal to fault surface, measured by two sets of eddy-currents sensors (Fig. 12C). These are non-contact sensors, made by Lion’s Precision that detect displacement due to change of the magnetic field with accuracy of $\sim 1 \mu$m. Each set of eddy-currents compose of two sensors facing each other (Fig. 12C), and located $180^\circ$ to each other. The eddy-currents fixed to the upper block measure the height change with respect to the lower eddy-current fixed to the lower block. We define closure between the two blocks as negative FND and dilation as positive FND.

Some experiments show wobbling (Fig. 13A) caused by an imperfect alignment of the upper and lower axes of rotation. The wobbling wavelength is equal to sample circumference, which makes it easy to identify and to separate from real wear of the experimental fault.

Wear-rates throughout each experiment were calculated and corrected form the initial fault-normal-displacement (FND) in the following procedure:

The frictional heating during slip led to sample expansion and thus to an apparent dilation and position FND measurement. To correct for this thermal effect, we continued to measure both temperature and FND after slip cessation for 60–120 s. During this period, the sample cooled and contracted under the same normal load of the experiment. This contracting during cooling generated a quasi-linear relations between FND closure and thermocouple temperature decrease (Fig. 13B). We calculated the slope of the curve, $t$ (units of $\mu$m/$^\circ$C), and regarded $t$ as an empirical thermal constant of sample dilation/contraction by heating/cooling. We used this constant to remove the thermal dilation component from the measured FND by calculating:

$$\text{TW} = \text{Total wear } [\mu\text{m}] = \text{FND} + t \cdot \Delta T$$

where $\Delta T$ is the temporal increase of the thermocouple temperature.

To minimize the effect of sample wobbling, we heated a granite sample with an electric heater (no slip or wear) while measuring the temperature and thermal induced FND as described above. The RMS of the difference between calculated and measured thermal FND is 3–10% of its total. Wear results are presented in geometric units: Wear is specified by microns of thermally corrected FND, and wear-rate is presented by $\mu$m/m, which is the wear per meter slip.

References


